

SCORING Guidance for Evaluators (used for Method of Approach and Experience and Expertise)	Points
Excellent, insightful response	5
A good response, provided details and some special insights	4
Adequate response, no special insights	3
Below average response, lacks detail and clarity	2
Insufficient response, missing requested information	1
Totally inadequate, no relevant response given	0

AHCCCS PROCUREMENT OFFICE SCORING TOOL				
YH26-0090 AHCCCS Independent Verification and Validation Services				
Evaluation Criteria	Points Max	Gartner		
		Evaluator's Score (0-5)	Weighted Score	
Experience and Capacity of the Firm and Key Personnel limit 2 pages		Consensus Comments		
10.3.1. The firm's knowledge and experience with IV&V, State Medicaid Technology Projects, and projects of comparable size and complexity.	125	3.5	88	Adequate response. The vendor's proposal demonstrated IV&V services in 13 states and has worked with various offices within the State of Arizona and County government. The vendor listed Eligibility frequently in various ways in table 2. Experience specifically with CMS and ServiceNow was not as robust as would be preferred. Comparison of similar sized-projects was not clear.
10.3.2. The firm's knowledge and experience with projects of similar scope and complexity.	125	3	75	Adequate response. The vendor's experience with other Arizona departments was demonstrated, however, it was not clear if other projects included IV&V expertise in other states. The proposal lacked demonstrated experience with similar implementations that leverage ServiceNow.
10.3.3. Experience of the proposed staff with this type of project, with list of names and classification of personnel expected to perform specific activities, including use of subcontractors;	100	3.5	70	Adequate response. Strength of individual staff members was clearly demonstrated, however, overall experience with CMS, IV&V and HR-1 implementations was lacking. The proposal was limited in detail around staffing IV&V and CMS Certification activities.
10.3.4. Submit key staff resumes for work history for the last five (5) years, their roles in each position, and two (2) individual references for each key staff personnel assigned to the project. Include emails and contact information for references.	100	3.5	70	Adequate response. Proposed resumes were strong and demonstrated clear experience and clearly identified the tasks that proposed staff completed in their work history. The proposal included limited insight into experience with MES, CMS, HR-1 and ServiceNow implementations.
Subtotal	450		303	
Method of Approach		Consensus Comments		
10.4.1. Proposed methodology and approach to fulfill the requirements of this project.	100	4	80	Good response. The proposal outlines the two projects identified in the scope. The V-Assur tool provides valuable functionality into gathering real-time insight into IV&V, and the approach includes demonstrated expertise in delivery.
10.4.2. Description of how you will satisfy each of the minimum criteria established.	100	3.5	70	Adequate response. Tasks included in the proposal were broken down into clear actionable steps. The proposed approach covers all of the minimum criteria sufficiently.
10.4.3. Description of required and any recommended deliverables.	100	3	60	Adequate response. The V-Assur tool provides a good option for managing and tracking project deliverables. The proposed timelines were clear and easy to understand. The proposal lacked additional insight into how the deliverables would tie into the overall methodology.
Subtotal	300		210	
Project Cost				
10.5.1. The project cost not to exceed (NTE) amount is based on the proposal submitted. Billing shall be based on Deliverables in Section 6.0, not to exceed agreed upon contracted total price.				
Subtotal	250		166	
TOTAL			679	

AHCCCS PROCUREMENT OFFICE SCORING TOOL

YH26-0090 AHCCCS Independent Verification and Validation Services

PCG				
Evaluation Criteria	Points Max	Evaluator's Score (0-5)	Weighted Score	
Experience and Capacity of the Firm and Key Personnel limit 2 pages		Consensus Comments		
10.3.1. The firm's knowledge and experience with IV&V, State Medicaid Technology Projects, and projects of comparable size and complexity.	125	4	100	Good response. The proposal demonstrated excellent experience in other states and in their work with CMS. Proposal demonstrates extensive experience with other similar IV&V projects.
10.3.2. The firm's knowledge and experience with projects of similar scope and complexity.	125	4	100	Good response. The proposal demonstrated strong IV&V experience, and also highlighted experience with ServiceNow implementations, and experience with HR1 and eligibility.
10.3.3. Experience of the proposed staff with this type of project, with list of names and classification of personnel expected to perform specific activities, including use of subcontractors;	100	4	80	Good response. The vendor's proposed staff demonstrate experience with HR1, MES, Eligibility and CMS. The staff proposed covered areas including testing and project management. Key staff are experienced with Medicaid and similar projects.
10.3.4. Submit key staff resumes for work history for the last five (5) years, their roles in each position, and two (2) individual references for each key staff personnel assigned to the project. Include emails and contact information for references.	100	4	80	Good response. The vendor's proposed staff have solid credentials and experience, with knowledge of IV&V and other similar projects.
Subtotal	450		360	
Method of Approach		Consensus Comments		
10.4.1. Proposed methodology and approach to fulfill the requirements of this project.	100	4	80	Good response. The vendor's proposed approach is clear and concise and draws on demonstrated expertise. The process flow easily laid out the proposed approach and benefits for AHCCCS. The approach covered the needs of each project included in the scope of work.
10.4.2. Description of how you will satisfy each of the minimum criteria established.	100	4	80	Good response. The vendor's approach demonstrated a strong understanding of the scope of work. The proposal outlined how the approach provides tangible benefits to AHCCCS.
10.4.3. Description of required and any recommended deliverables.	100	4	80	Good response. The proposal outlined a solid understanding of the anticipated deliverables, and the example deliverables provided were easy to understand and comprehend. The sample project dashboard was clear and concise.
Subtotal	300		240	
Project Cost				
10.5.1. The project cost not to exceed (NTE) amount is based on the proposal submitted. Billing shall be based on Deliverables in Section 6.0, not to exceed agreed upon contracted total price.			250	
Subtotal	250		250	
TOTAL			850	

Criteria	Points Max	Gartner	PCG
Experience and Expertise	450	303	360
Method and Approach	300	210	240
Project Cost	250	166	250
TOTAL SCORE	1000	679	850

Evaluation Committee (Scoring Team) Members Attestation:
We hereby attest that the points awarded to each offeror listed on this Scoring Sheet were scored in accordance with the established evaluation criteria and represent our best judgment of each offeror's proposal. As indicated by the scores and the justification in the Executive Summary, our recommendation for contract award is:

NAME OF RECOMMENDED AWARDED VENDOR:	Public Consulting Group LLC
Julie Barabash	DocuSigned by: <i>Julie Barabash</i> 7/20/2026
Janice French	Signed by: <i>Janice French</i> 7/21/2026
Kristi Schinkel	Signed by: <i>Kristi Schinkel</i> 7/20/2026

AHCCCS PROCUREMENT OFFICE SCORING TOOL: B7 - COST PROPOSAL

$$\left(\frac{\text{Price}_{lowest}}{\text{Price}_{offered}} \right) \times \text{Points}_{max} = \text{Points}_{awarded}$$

Price Lowest: \$4,730,369.00
Points Max: 250

TOTAL 5 YEAR PRICE
Cost Points Awarded

Gartner	PCG
166	250

Gartner	Total System Cost Summaries							
	Description	One Time Costs	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5	Total
BAFO	Solution Costs	\$-	\$2,675,000.00	\$2,675,000.00	\$1,770,000.00			\$7,120,000.00

PCG	Total System Cost Summaries							
	Description	One Time Costs	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5	Total
BAFO	Solution Costs	\$-	\$946,153	\$937,508	\$928,781	\$931,831	\$986,096	\$4,730,369.00

Certificate Of Completion

Envelope Id: E2F4F2EB-2018-8D98-8032-C891E50F316E

Status: Completed

Subject: Complete with Docusign: YH26-0090 Final Consensus Evaluation-PDF.pdf

Source Envelope:

Document Pages: 5

Signatures: 3

Envelope Originator:

Certificate Pages: 5

Initials: 0

Cynthia Smolens

AutoNav: Enabled

150 N 18th Avenue

Envelopeld Stamping: Enabled

Phoenix, AZ 85007

Time Zone: (UTC-07:00) Arizona

Cynthia.Smolens@azahcccs.gov

IP Address: 20.236.201.102

Record Tracking

Status: Original

Holder: Cynthia Smolens

Location: DocuSign

7/20/2026 3:39:00 PM

Cynthia.Smolens@azahcccs.gov

Security Appliance Status: Connected

Pool: StateLocal

Signer Events

Janice French

Janice.French@azahcccs.gov

Security Level: Email, Account Authentication
(None)

Signature

Signed by:
Janice French
F13093DF7CD2479...

Signature Adoption: Pre-selected Style

Using IP Address: 50.20.127.85

Timestamp

Sent: 7/20/2026 3:46:45 PM

Viewed: 7/21/2026 7:10:44 AM

Signed: 7/21/2026 7:11:26 AM

Electronic Record and Signature Disclosure:

Accepted: 7/21/2026 7:10:44 AM

ID: 17c57094-7b1f-411d-a152-415c2693b168

Company Name: Carahsoft OBO Arizona Health Care Cost Containment System

Julie Barabash

Julie.Barabash@azahcccs.gov

Project Manager

AHCCCS

Security Level: Email, Account Authentication
(None)

DocuSigned by:
Julie Barabash
55FEBAF607134ED...

Signature Adoption: Pre-selected Style

Using IP Address: 173.26.229.53

Sent: 7/20/2026 3:46:46 PM

Viewed: 7/20/2026 3:54:10 PM

Signed: 7/20/2026 3:54:18 PM

Electronic Record and Signature Disclosure:

Not Offered via Docusign

Kristi Schinkel

Kristi.Schinkel@azahcccs.gov

Security Level: Email, Account Authentication
(None)

Signed by:
Kristi Schinkel
DAE249E04E6E4B0...

Signature Adoption: Pre-selected Style

Using IP Address:

2607:fb91:4100:d8d:d1c5:870f:a803:2692

Sent: 7/20/2026 3:46:46 PM

Viewed: 7/20/2026 3:48:31 PM

Signed: 7/20/2026 3:56:31 PM

Electronic Record and Signature Disclosure:

Accepted: 7/20/2026 3:48:31 PM

ID: b93ebd7e-b4dd-4b60-9308-06e3566ba5e8

Company Name: Carahsoft OBO Arizona Health Care Cost Containment System

In Person Signer Events

Signature

Timestamp

Editor Delivery Events

Status

Timestamp

Agent Delivery Events

Status

Timestamp

Intermediary Delivery Events

Status

Timestamp

Certified Delivery Events	Status	Timestamp
Carbon Copy Events	Status	Timestamp
Witness Events	Signature	Timestamp
Notary Events	Signature	Timestamp
Envelope Summary Events	Status	Timestamps
Envelope Sent	Hashed/Encrypted	7/20/2026 3:46:46 PM
Certified Delivered	Security Checked	7/20/2026 3:48:31 PM
Signing Complete	Security Checked	7/20/2026 3:56:31 PM
Completed	Security Checked	7/21/2026 7:11:26 AM
Payment Events	Status	Timestamps
Electronic Record and Signature Disclosure		

ELECTRONIC RECORD AND SIGNATURE DISCLOSURE

From time to time, Arizona Health Care Cost Containment System (we, us or Company) may be required by law to provide to you certain written notices or disclosures. Described below are the terms and conditions for providing to you such notices and disclosures electronically through the DocuSign system. Please read the information below carefully and thoroughly, and if you can access this information electronically to your satisfaction and agree to this Electronic Record and Signature Disclosure (ERSD), please confirm your agreement by selecting the check-box next to 'I agree to use electronic records and signatures' before clicking 'CONTINUE' within the DocuSign system.

Getting paper copies

At any time, you may request from us a paper copy of any record provided or made available electronically to you by us. You will have the ability to download and print documents we send to you through the DocuSign system during and immediately after the signing session and, if you elect to create a DocuSign account, you may access the documents for a limited period of time (usually 30 days) after such documents are first sent to you. After such time, if you wish for us to send you paper copies of any such documents from our office to you, you will be charged a \$0.00 per-page fee. You may request delivery of such paper copies from us by following the procedure described below.

Withdrawing your consent

If you decide to receive notices and disclosures from us electronically, you may at any time change your mind and tell us that thereafter you want to receive required notices and disclosures only in paper format. How you must inform us of your decision to receive future notices and disclosure in paper format and withdraw your consent to receive notices and disclosures electronically is described below.

Consequences of changing your mind

If you elect to receive required notices and disclosures only in paper format, it will slow the speed at which we can complete certain steps in transactions with you and delivering services to you because we will need first to send the required notices or disclosures to you in paper format, and then wait until we receive back from you your acknowledgment of your receipt of such paper notices or disclosures. Further, you will no longer be able to use the DocuSign system to receive required notices and consents electronically from us or to sign electronically documents from us.

All notices and disclosures will be sent to you electronically

Unless you tell us otherwise in accordance with the procedures described herein, we will provide electronically to you through the DocuSign system all required notices, disclosures, authorizations, acknowledgements, and other documents that are required to be provided or made available to you during the course of our relationship with you. To reduce the chance of you inadvertently not receiving any notice or disclosure, we prefer to provide all of the required notices and disclosures to you by the same method and to the same address that you have given us. Thus, you can receive all the disclosures and notices electronically or in paper format through the paper mail delivery system. If you do not agree with this process, please let us know as described below. Please also see the paragraph immediately above that describes the consequences of your electing not to receive delivery of the notices and disclosures electronically from us.

How to contact Arizona Health Care Cost Containment System:

You may contact us to let us know of your changes as to how we may contact you electronically, to request paper copies of certain information from us, and to withdraw your prior consent to receive notices and disclosures electronically as follows:

To contact us by email send messages to: anthony.flot@azahcccs.gov

To advise Arizona Health Care Cost Containment System of your new email address

To let us know of a change in your email address where we should send notices and disclosures electronically to you, you must send an email message to us at anthony.flot@azahcccs.gov and in the body of such request you must state: your previous email address, your new email address. We do not require any other information from you to change your email address.

If you created a DocuSign account, you may update it with your new email address through your account preferences.

To request paper copies from Arizona Health Care Cost Containment System

To request delivery from us of paper copies of the notices and disclosures previously provided by us to you electronically, you must send us an email to anthony.flot@azahcccs.gov and in the body of such request you must state your email address, full name, mailing address, and telephone number. We will bill you for any fees at that time, if any.

To withdraw your consent with Arizona Health Care Cost Containment System

To inform us that you no longer wish to receive future notices and disclosures in electronic format you may:

- i. decline to sign a document from within your signing session, and on the subsequent page, select the check-box indicating you wish to withdraw your consent, or you may;
- ii. send us an email to anthony.flot@azahcccs.gov and in the body of such request you must state your email, full name, mailing address, and telephone number. We do not need any other information from you to withdraw consent.. The consequences of your withdrawing consent for online documents will be that transactions may take a longer time to process..

Required hardware and software

The minimum system requirements for using the DocuSign system may change over time. The current system requirements are found here: <https://support.docusign.com/guides/signer-guide-signing-system-requirements>.

Acknowledging your access and consent to receive and sign documents electronically

To confirm to us that you can access this information electronically, which will be similar to other electronic notices and disclosures that we will provide to you, please confirm that you have read this ERSD, and (i) that you are able to print on paper or electronically save this ERSD for your future reference and access; or (ii) that you are able to email this ERSD to an email address where you will be able to print on paper or save it for your future reference and access. Further, if you consent to receiving notices and disclosures exclusively in electronic format as described herein, then select the check-box next to ‘I agree to use electronic records and signatures’ before clicking ‘CONTINUE’ within the DocuSign system.

By selecting the check-box next to ‘I agree to use electronic records and signatures’, you confirm that:

- You can access and read this Electronic Record and Signature Disclosure; and
- You can print on paper this Electronic Record and Signature Disclosure, or save or send this Electronic Record and Disclosure to a location where you can print it, for future reference and access; and
- Until or unless you notify Arizona Health Care Cost Containment System as described above, you consent to receive exclusively through electronic means all notices, disclosures, authorizations, acknowledgements, and other documents that are required to be provided or made available to you by Arizona Health Care Cost Containment System during the course of your relationship with Arizona Health Care Cost Containment System.